

**Public Policy and root less growth in India: An analytical review**

Anchal Malhotra<sup>1</sup> Vijay Srivastava<sup>2</sup> Suresh Kashyap<sup>3</sup> Megha Dua<sup>4</sup> Shabnam Bania<sup>5</sup>

**ABSTRACT:**

Public policy is the policy which is adopted by government in order to ensure the welfare of the society as a whole. Public policy formulated and implemented by the policy makers in order to achieve the economic growth rate in terms of increase per capita income. Any public policy which ensures the higher economic growth rate can be regarded as effective and successful one is still a debatable issue. Only by ensuring high economic growth does not mean that development is there because development is not only depending on increasing the availability of goods and services rather it is also related to improving the lives of people. Policies that are undertaken at the expense of culture bring rootless growth in economy. This is one of the negative growths out of the five growths which proves to be detrimental for the society as it ensures the higher economic growth rate but at the risk of people's identity and their traditional values. From the last few years, government implemented various policies that only aim at bringing uniformity in diversified culture that exists in India. But in emerging economy like India, where language changes at every 10 km so bringing homogenous policy is not a good measure by the government. Government should come up with those public policies which take into consideration the cultural values. Diversity in plants and animals are valuable resource for any economy in the same way diversified culture offers a chance to look at the world differently through different ways. Policy should be adopted which ensures the quality instead of quantity of the growth.

**Keywords:** per capita income, diversified culture, uniformity, language, valuable resource.

---

1Student MSC Hons (Economics) Programme, Mittal School of Business , Lovely Professional University , Pghwara, Punjab email : anchalmalhotra666@gmail.com

2. Assistant Professor, Mittal School of Business, Lovely Professional University, Pghwara Punjab. Email : vijay.19825@lpu.co.in

3. Professor and Associate Dean , Mittal School of Business (ACBSP USA Accredited), Pghwara Punjab. Email: suresh.kashyap@lpu.co.in

4. Research Scholar in Economics, Mittal School of Business (ACBSP USA Accredited), Pghwara Punjab. Email : meghaduaeco@gmail.com

5. Student MSC Hons (Economics) Programme, Mittal School of Business , Lovely Professional University, Punjab . Email : shabnambania14560@gmail.com

**INTRODUCTION**

Achieving the economic growth by providing goods and services in large quantity has been a major economic objective of policy makers while formulating a policy. By delivering large quantity of goods and services, people's standard of living will improve as a whole as they are of

the view that this is the best way to increase the well-being of human. Policy makers regard economic growth as a solution to various problems like decreasing unemployment and budgetary deficits. But achieving a growth is really regarded as a solution for problems? Is economic growth a significant way to enrich people's way of living? Does quality and structure of growth matter in 21<sup>st</sup> century?

There is variety of views who feel that achieving growth only is not the solution to all problems and believes that quality as well as structure of the growth also matters for improving the lives of people. Even in this plentiful rich and prosperous world, quality of people is still poor. In order to evaluate the quality of economic growth in real sense, the elements of human development can play a significant role. What is "ethical" economic growth that proves to be fruitful in enhancing the standard of living? Economic growth is one which aims to generate the employment opportunities along with assurance of the livelihood of people. It is the growth that provides equal benefits and boost people's freedom by safeguarding their cultural values, languages and identities. If at any stage economic growth fails to establish the link with Human Development as whole and not managed properly then growth will not regarded as efficient one rather it can be jobless, ruthless, rootless, voiceless, futureless growth.

Among all the growth that is mentioned above our concern is with **ROOT LESS GROWTH which means achieving the growth at the cost of cultural value, minority identities or traditional ways.** Modern Economic growth is destroying or decaying the diversity of culture that exists in a particular economy. It aims at bringing the element of homogeneity where huge diversification exists in culture. Formulating and implementing those policies which cause the people's culture values to vanish instead of enriching their lives then it only resulted in a Root less growth. Policy makers and government are trying to bring uniformity in the diversified economy. The emerging economies like India are adopting the policies without realizing the heterogeneity of the population. In India, language keeps changing every 10 kms. Bringing with it change in culture, eating habits and requirements of the people. Language is the way to express the culture values and identities of group. In many regions or areas, dominating cultures whose power has been increased with the economic growth are destroying the cultural identities of minority group. Many Indian leaders felt that traditional culture and values were pulled out of the economy due to modernization and expansion.

For example, according to the People's Linguistic Survey 2013 of India 780 different languages are spoken by the whole economy and 86 different scripts are used in different cultures of the economy. But only 22 languages were get recognition by the government as official languages. Along with the loss of 250 languages in India, government also bringing uniformity in chasing growth for nation-building – like National language. Remote places like Patalkot where people used to spoke language were now no longer spoken due to the dominating languages that exist in this modern world. In short, loss of languages resulted in loss of culture because of the aim of bringing economic growth by providing large quantity of goods and services.

Twenty first century is the era of globalization where different societies with different culture are living together by sharing the limited resources. It is expected that about 10,000 different culture exists in economy but with the emergence of modern economic growth various traditional cultures and values are sweeping away or start eliminating from the society which ultimately affects the people standard of living as well as their identity. Policy makers are putting stress only on achieving those policies which increase the economic growth rate without considering

culture diversity, identities of minority groups and values into account. Culture values are regarded as the core values that cannot be endangered as a result of modernization and development.

Public policies adopted and implemented by the policy makers, leaders and government of India results in the negative economic growth. These policy makers are always fascinated by quantity of growth without considering the dimensions of Human development. Policies need to be concerned with the quality of growth. Policy can be regarded as distorted if policy makers fail to pay attention on these issues.

This study aims at knowing what type of policies have been adopted by the policy makers in order to achieve growth at the expense of culture and values. In shaping public policies, the main element of Human development i.e. their diversified culture is ignored which ultimately hampers the overall development of the economy. Growth can be regarded as a mean to achieve the end goal of economy i.e. Human development along with overall development. This can only be possible when the links are established between both and continuously strengthened by the expertise and skill full policy management.

### **OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY**

- ❖ To examine how culture values, identities, languages were endangered by adopting policies for economic growth.
- ❖ To analyzing the causes of root less growth in economy and how growth is regarded as mean to achieve development.
- ❖ To observing various measures and solutions for achieving the real and significant growth rate as a whole.

### **METHODOLOGY**

This study analyzes the role of culture, values and identities in policy making process of India. Review of literature helps us to understand different viewpoint of researchers and scholars related to the given topic. Information about the various polices is taken from their official and authenticated websites. Different policies and facts have been taken to support how the modern economic growth is detrimental for the Human development and can take the form of rootless economic growth. Latest example of New Education Policy has also been given into the study.

### **LITERATURE REVIEW**

**Mridul Dharwal et.al (2013)** made an analysis of the myth of Economic growth in India with the special reference to Human Development. They found that from the past two decades, Indian economy achieved higher growth rate in terms increase per capita but this achievement only in terms of quantity is detrimental for the Human development as it lacks the exactness. They analyzed that out of total number the World's poor population 1/3 rd of poor are from Indian Economy. They analyzed various factors in which Indian economy is lacking despite of fact Indian Economy is doing well. Their study suggests that this type of economic growth can only be regarded as unbalanced and asymmetrical until and unless government adopt corrective measures. Economic growth can be rootless, ruthless, jobless etc and policy makers are just

focusing on those policies which result in modern economic growth that is not considered as a mean to achieve the economic goal.

**Katherine Daniell (2014)** analyzed the role of culture in shaping the public policy. She found that culture affects the policy making process and policy process affects the culture and values in return. Social and cultural values are the factors that influence the behavior of the human and public policy also want to shape the behavior of economy but at the cost of cultural values. She found that culture is not constant and complex in nature. She analyzed that values, preferences and the choice of people influence the decisions of policy makers in different ways in different countries and in return decisions related to those policies affect the culture

**Omar Khan (2015)** observed the ethnic inequality is widespread and a drag on the global economy. He examined that minority group's identities are suffering from losses and facing discrimination and policymakers are doing nothing to consider the inequality issues in policy making process. Policymakers made the policies in favor of dominant culture and as a result the power of dominant cultures increased. With the increase power, they are the one who are getting benefits through the policies that are implemented in achieving the economic growth. He analyzed that poverty rates in India are declining as general with the help of policies that have been adopted but for certain groups like Dalits, Adivasis it is still high which shows that policies fail to enrich the lives of people as a whole in the economy. He suggested that economic policies that are adopted for achieving the higher growth rates by addressing the issue of poverty will also address and raise the concerns for the inequalities that exist for the minority groups and withering their identities from the society.

**Oswald Ruiz Chiriboga (2006)** examined the right to Culture Identity of Indigenous peoples and National Minorities by looking at various ways to protect the rights of minorities while formulating economic policies. He found that policy makers should formulate and implement those policies that do not include the principle of exclusion rather favor the element of inclusion. He observed that imposition of policies resulted in the destruction of indigenous people's identity and destroyed their traditional cultures & values. This paper observed that participation of minority groups in the policy management affairs is very important. He analyzed various articles related to protecting the identities of minority such as article 18 which aims at giving right to the different culture people to preserve their language and write their names in their own languages. This paper recommended that there is need of creating a different method to coordinate and evaluate the policies that should include the rights of minorities and maintain their identity.

**Stephen Muers (2017)** analyzed that culture comes first and putting culture & values at the centre of public policy. He observed that changing culture is not easy and quick job in diversified economy where used to exist 10,000 culture. He found in his study that policy leader ignored the dimensions of Human development. While formulating policies for achieving the economic growth, values and cultures are the missing components. In determining the overall development both values and culture play a significant role as they are directly linked with people way of living and their standards. He presented the various examples of other countries that take into consideration all the ingredients that are required to reflect a true and impressive growth rate such as China and Mauritius. He suggested that effective policy is one which not only achieve higher growth rate but also include culture and values system that brings positive change in the democratic and modernized world.

**Neha Singh (2020)** analyzed the benefit of one nation and one language where diversity exists in emerging economy like India. She found that in India there are 1,369 languages that are spoken by people and out of which only 22 languages get status of official language. Many political leaders and policy makers are of the view that in order to bring uniformity in the economy there is a need to adopt only one language as a whole that brings several religions together. She found that policy makers find a lot of advantages that are associated with the one national language as it will provide the benefits to business, research, education, job opportunities etc. She observed that one language in one nation will boost the national unity and automatically results in overall development of the economy. Bringing homogeneity in the languages proves to be beneficial for the growth as well for the development. She also suggested that in various areas, this will lead to protest as it put extra burden of learning new language.

### **ECONOMIC GROWTH AT THE COST OF CULTURAL VALUES**

It is the responsibility of policy makers to answer various questions at every stage of policy making process like where growth is major or going. Is everyone getting benefit from the particular policy? Is that policy is creating enough employment opportunities? Is the policy takes into consideration the diversity in culture? Are people are taking part in obtaining the fruitful benefits from the policy? These questions need to be answered by the policy makers and political leaders. Development that only brings inequality is neither regarded as feasible nor encouraging. High economic growth rate has been achieved through policies that are undertaken by the policymakers and Government. But this economic growth in 21<sup>st</sup> century is regarded as Modern Economic Growth that brings the element of homogeneity in diversified economy like India. Enriching the culture of people is one of the important objectives of Human development. **Mahatma Gandhi**, the father of our nation also expressed his views on cultural diversity by saying that:

*“he do not want that his house to be walled in all four sides and windows to be closed rather he wants that each and every culture that exists on the mother’s land to move in his house as freely as possible. And he also deny to be thrown away his feet by anyone”.*

Diversity in flora and fauna regarded as a valuable resource for any economy in the same way diversification in culture and values are also regarded as deep pockets of looking the economy in different ways. Various countries have achieved tremendous growth rates in terms of per capita income but in reality some countries are growing at the expense of culture and identities. Some countries adopt those policies that restricted the culture freedom of the people and some countries are also there that still considered respecting each and every culture like Indigenous culture is important for the development.

Like **Soviet policy that has been adopted in Central Asia** left little space for culture freedom. Before the implementation of soviet policy in central Asia, Islamic religion had gained so much popularity but after the adoption of Soviet Policy in 1929, Islam was badly defeated and as a result all the books written in Arabic were destroyed. All the Mosques and temples were destroyed and conducting any rituals in Muslim almost become unfeasible. By the end of 1941, there were only 1000 mosques as compared to 26,000 mosques in 1912. It created the situation of ethnic conflict in various parts of central Asia and killed more than 50,000 people due to war in Tajikistan. Though this policy aims at bringing rapid industrialization in the economy which

leads to higher economic growth but this policy destroys the culture of Muslims and suppressed the Islam religion as a whole. Same situations exist in Latin American countries also. **Guatemala, country in Central America** where more than 60% of population belongs to indigenous groups never give recognition to their language as official language and always get unfair treatment from the dominating culture when they speak in their own language.

Not all the countries are on same track to ignore the ethnic diversity; some countries still give great respect to each and every culture. Like **Mauritius**, it is a growing due to the freedom to ethnic diversity. This country which contains a mixture of different immigrants from another countries like Asia, Africa, Europe etc that bring their own religion and culture values. So instead of imposing homogeneity, the country is trying to achieve success not only in terms of growth **but also in terms of human development by accepting religious tolerance and diversity.**

India is one of the most diversified countries in the world. Each and every nook corner in India has a unique culture. Religions of people play a very significant role in their lives as it represents people's identity. But now with the introduction of new modern economic growth rate, India is losing its culture and values. Adopting such policies which aims to foster the economic growth is causing the people's culture to wither which is known as Rootless Economic Growth. India is trying to infuse the different socio-ethnic groups into one nation by merging various cultural differences. Imposing uniformity in culture is destroying the identity of minority groups as these groups are being forced to adapt the culture of dominant groups. In India, Schedule tribes constitute 8.6% of total population and more than 90% of them are living in rural areas of economy. This can be viewed with the help of examples:

### **Dying Languages and imposition of National language**

Language is a tool to express people identity and their values. Language and culture of people are interlinked with each other. But with the adoption of development policies, many languages are dying. **According to UNESCO report, there are total 780 languages out of which 600 languages are endangered. In 1971**, government came up with the policy that any language which is not spoken by more than 10,000 people, then language needs not to be included in official language. These 600 languages are spoken by most of the minority groups. For example, tribal languages such as Korku, Halidi, and Mavchi were almost disappeared. When language of any group starts dying then it hampers their traditional livelihood and culture.

| <b>Endangered languages in countries</b> | <b>No:</b> |
|--|------------|
| India                                    | 197        |
| US                                       | 191        |
| Brazil                                   | 190        |
| Indonesia                                | 143        |
| Canada                                   | 87         |

**SOURCE:** Economic Times

Last year in 2019, India came up with the agenda of **“One Nation, One language”** which means imposing Hindi across the country. Indian agenda to promote one language i.e. Hindi created a situation of protest in some southern parts of India as it put extra burden on non-Hindi speaking states like Telangana, Andhra Pradesh. It is also observed that if it is imposed then more than

1,000 Indian languages will be destroyed in upcoming future. Dying language ultimately leads to loss of culture and create ethnic conflicts within the societies.

### **Principle of Exclusion in making Public Policies in India**

Policies formulated and implemented by the policymakers keeping in mind the economic objective is to achieve more economic growth in terms of increase income. Policymakers while formulating any policies forget to take into account the quality and structure of growth. As a result, majority of people are still poor in terms of the quality of their life and always suffer from discrimination from the dominated culture and ethnic groups. Like recently, policymakers came up with the policy i.e. **New Citizenship Policy** which aims at providing the opportunity to many citizens of Afghanistan, Bangladesh and Pakistan to easily apply for Indian citizenship. The new citizenship amendment bill aims to give Indian nationality only to Hindus, Jains, Parsis and Sikhs not to the Muslims immigrants. This policy aim is to provide opportunities as whole but this policy excluded the minority group i.e. Muslim. The exclusion of Muslims leads to the protests in all over the India. This is one of examples which show that policy formulated and implemented by the government is discriminatory in nature and losing the identity of the minority groups.

Imposing the dominant development shift on the minority groups is affecting their culture and their standard of living. It is of no doubt that government has adopted some measures to protect the right of indigenous people like **Forest Rights Act** in order to protect the people. But due to lack of government funds, lack of proper planning and various loopholes made the **implementation ineffective** in nature. With the increasing growth rate of economy, these Adivasis are losing their way of life, their culture and their livelihoods. Inclusive growth pattern enhance the cultural traditions and provide various opportunities to exchange their culture in a diversified economy. On the other hand, exclusive based growth can discriminatory in nature and ultimately deteriorates the cultural identity. It is important to note here not every traditional culture should be a victim of indiscriminate respect like some exercises such as burning of widows, domestic violence, killing foeticide are against the ethics and laws of culture. But in various aspects, imposing homogeneity in culture will only result in losing the heritage values.

Though we are of the view that imposing uniformity in culture with the help of policies will only lead to the destruction of well-being of people. People do not want to change their culture, their languages and their way of living at any economic cost. Culture values are lost while adopting any policy that brings the element of homogeneity. But some researchers are of the view that with the introduction of globalization Indian economy already introduced the concept of homogeneity in their culture. They came up with the examples that shows that all public policies are not cause rootless growth in the economy. Introducing homogeneity in culture is not bad at some extent.

### **Globalization and Culture Homogeneity**

With the introduction of LPG in 1991, our country gets connected with the rest of the world and brings the uniformity in culture. Globalization plays a significant role in providing employment opportunities, bringing western culture and new standards to live the life. Adoption of modernization, promoting English as official language and changing food habits along with new

lifestyle automatically imposed the uniform American culture in Indian economy as whole. Generation gaps, modern and western lifestyles, planning of nuclear families from Joint families etc all lead to declining of culture among the Indian youths. It is of general belief that different culture creates the situation of conflict in multi socio-ethnic states. Sometimes different culture can become the major source of conflicts as one culture start dominating the other culture. Many conflicts arises due to the uneven distribution of resources among the different culture so in that bringing homogeneity and merging different culture values are regarded as good move by Government.

Though conflicts arises in ethnic society and culture homogeneity was also brought through globalization but still it is inadequate to bring homogeneity or uniformity in those economies which are rich in culture, traditions and languages. Because unity exists in diversity and this can only be achieved by protecting and preserving each and every culture.

### **Multilingualism in New Education Policy in India**

New Education Policy or NEP (2020) recently focuses on promoting multilingualism in learning process. New Education Policy aims at providing content and material in eight regional languages and focus on mother tongue as medium of transferring the instructions. The HRD ministry was of the view that no official language will be imposed on any student as they can now easily grasp the knowledge in their own languages which ensure the maintenance of their culture values by preserving their local language. The progress of any nation depends on education policy also. Language is not only regarded as medium of communication but also a way to represent culture and national values. The need of an hour is to preserve the mother tongue or their local languages which reflects the people's identity. By introducing the concept of Multilingualism in NEP, it will surely help the tribal people children who faced discrimination on the grounds of the imposed language creates the gap between their learning processes.

Government introduced the multilingualism element in NEP, 2020 just to ensure the equality in resources. By introducing such kind of policies in economy will automatically lead to the overall development of the nation.

### **RECOMMENDATIONS AND SUGGESTIONS**

In order to preserve the identities of minority groups, Minority Rights Declaration have been adopted to protect the values and culture of minority as these groups are mostly considered as vulnerable and excludable one. The need of an hour is to protect their culture, their traditional values, their way of living and languages. Primary need is to conserve their language which automatically conserves the culture of tribal people. **Government should set up the committees that decide what is spoken in language or not. Government can also adopt the measures to publish dictionaries in the languages.** Like Odisha government published dictionaries in 21 tribal languages which ensures the identity of the people.

Growth is the way to achieve Human Development. Growth that creates inequality in the country cannot regard as optimal and impressive one. Policymakers should take into consideration each and every culture value whether it is related to majority group or minority group because the ultimate goal of any public policy is to enrich the standard of living of people.

### **CONCLUSION**

High Economic growth does not always ensure the overall development in the economy especially Human Development. Economic growth is a mean or a way to achieve the final end i.e. Human development not in terms of goods and services in large quantity rather in terms of enriching the lives of people. If Economic Growth cannot manage properly then it can be ruthless, voiceless, rootless, jobless or futureless growth. Implementing public policies at the cost of culture and tradition then it is Rootless growth. Artificially infusing different ethnic groups into one nation by merging the cultural differences is not a good move where diversification exists. By introducing uniformity in ethnic society can only raised the power of dominant culture and in return they start discrimination against the minority groups. We have seen various policies that destroyed the identity of tribal people and minority groups.

Policy makers are fascinated by the quantity of growth but dire need is to pay attention on quality and structure of growth by providing benefits to all without any discrimination. Efficient and impressive growth is one which promotes the welfare of the society by providing employment opportunities, by providing equal access of resources to all irrespective of rich and poor, by taking into consideration the diversification of culture and by raising the standard of living in real sense. Policy makers and government should focus on quality not on quantity only then development is considered as sustainable and impressive one.

## REFERENCES

1. Chiriboga, O.R. (2006). The right to culture identity of indigenous peoples and national minorities. A look from the Inter-American System. *SUR-Int'I J. on Hum Rts.* 5, 43.
2. Dharwal, M., Gola, K.R., Agarwal, A, A., & Panyakom, S. (2013). An Analysis of the Myth of Economic Growth in India with Special Reference to Human Development. In *Proceedings of International Conference on Business Management & IS* (Vol.2, No.1).
3. Daniell, K.A. (2014). The role of national culture in shaping public policy: A review of the literature. *Australia: The Australian National University.*
4. Erickson, A. (2017). How the USSR's effort to destroy Islam created a generation of radicals. *The Washington Post*, January, 5.
5. Khan, O. (2015). Ethnic inequality is widespread and a drag on the global economy. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from <https://www.theguardian.com/public-leaders-network/2015/jan/20/ethnic-inequality-widespread-global-economy>.
6. Khan, T. (2020). The Citizenship Amendment Act, 2019: A Religion Based Pathway to Indian Citizenship. Available at SSRN 3665743.
7. Muers, S. (2017). Culture comes first: Putting culture and values at the centre of the public policy. Centre for Public Impact.
8. Mohanty, A. (2020). Several decades after Independence, many tribal languages in India face extinction threat. Down to Earth.

9. Mehta, H. (2020). How conserving tribal languages will preserve dying cultures. DailyOpinion News and Analysis on Latest Breaking News India.
10. Parth, V. (2019). *Globalization will end up making all cultures of the world homogenous*: Critically examine the statement taking examples from socio-culture and economic life of India.
11. Shukla, A. (2020). New Education Policy does not shed English Language but focuses on Multilingualism.
12. Singh, N. (2020). One Nation, One Language: Pros and Cons. E-Justice India.
13. The Logical Indian. (2019). *How development excludes India's tribal people*.
14. Human Development Report 1996.